

WILLIAM MILLER

William: “will” and “helmet.”

“As I was fully convinced,’ says Miller, ‘that all Scripture given by inspiration of God is profitable (2 Timothy 3:16); that **it came not at any time by the will of man**, but was written as holy men were moved by the Holy Ghost (2 Peter 1:21), and was written ‘for our learning, that we through patience and comfort of the Scriptures might have hope’ (Romans 15:4), I could but regard the chronological portions of the Bible as being as much a portion of the word of God, and as much entitled to our serious consideration, as any other portion of the Scriptures. I therefore felt that in endeavoring to comprehend what God had in His mercy seen fit to reveal to us, I had no right to pass over the prophetic periods.’— Bliss, page 75.” *The Great Controversy*, 324.

“Those who proclaimed this warning gave the right message at the right time. But as the early disciples declared, ‘The time is fulfilled, and the kingdom of God is at hand,’ based on the prophecy of Daniel 9, while they failed to perceive that the death of the Messiah was foretold in the same scripture, so Miller and his associates preached the message based on Daniel 8:14 and Revelation 14:7, and failed to see that there were still other messages brought to view in Revelation 14, which were also to be given before the advent of the Lord. As the disciples were mistaken in regard to the kingdom to be set up at the end of the seventy weeks, so Adventists were mistaken in regard to the event to take place at the expiration of the 2300 days. In both cases there was an acceptance of, or rather an adherence to, popular errors that blinded the mind to the truth. **Both classes fulfilled the will of God in delivering the message which He desired to be given**, and both, through their own misapprehension of their message, suffered disappointment.” *The Great Controversy*, 352.

For he put on righteousness as a breastplate, and an **helmet of salvation** upon his head; and he put on the garments of vengeance *for* clothing, and was clad with zeal as a cloak. Isaiah 59:17. See also Ephesians 6:17 and 1 Thessalonians 5:7, 8.

Miller: a person who operates a mill, esp. a mill that grinds grain into flour.

“The knowledge of God is not to be gained without mental effort, without prayer for wisdom in order **that you may separate from the pure grain of truth** the chaff with which men and Satan have misrepresented the doctrines of truth. Satan and his confederacy of human agents have endeavored to mix the chaff of error with **the wheat of truth**. We should diligently search for the hidden treasure, and seek wisdom from heaven in order to separate human inventions from the divine commands. The Holy Spirit will aid the seeker for great and precious truths which relate to the plan of redemption. I would impress upon all the fact that a casual reading of the Scriptures is not enough. We must search, and this means the doing of all the word implies. As the miner eagerly explores the earth to discover its veins of gold, so **you are to explore the word of God for the hidden treasure** that Satan has so long sought to hide from man. The Lord says, ‘If any man willeth to do his will, he shall know of the teaching.’ John 7:17, Revised Version.

“The word of God is truth and light, and is to be a lamp unto your feet, to guide you every step of the way to the gates of the city of God. It is for this reason that Satan has made such desperate efforts to obstruct the path that has been cast up for the ransomed of the Lord to walk in. You are not to take your ideas to the Bible, and make your opinions a center around which truth is to revolve. You are to lay aside your ideas at the door of investigation, and with humble, subdued hearts, with self hid in Christ, with earnest prayer, you are to seek wisdom from God. You should feel that you must know the revealed will of God, because it concerns your personal, eternal welfare. The Bible is a directory by which you may know the way to eternal life. You should desire above all things that you may know the will and ways of the Lord. You should not search for the purpose of finding texts of Scripture that you can construe to prove your theories; for the word of God declares that this is wresting the Scriptures to your own destruction. You must empty yourselves of every prejudice, and come in the spirit of prayer to the investigation of the word of God.” *Review and Herald*, September 11, 1894.

William Miller was born at Pittsfield, Massachusetts. His formal schooling consisted of only 18 months, but he became self-taught through his strong habit of reading. He also early began to write, composing poetry and keeping a diary. His reading exposed him to infidel authors who influenced him in the direction of deism. He became a justice of the peace in his late twenties, and fought in the War of 1812. Several experiences during this conflict turned his mind toward a personal God. By 1816 he was converted, and began Bible study in earnest. He wrote, ‘The Scriptures . . . became my delight, and in Jesus I found a friend.’

By 1818 in his study of the prophecies he concluded that Jesus would return ‘about 1843.’ In 1831 he began to share his studies in public in small settings, after strong conviction and providential guidance to do so. After meeting J. V. Himes, a prominent editor, in 1839, the way was opened to preach to large groups in major cities. While opposed by many, his preaching, and that of others who caught the Advent message, made a significant impact, with up to 100,000 accepting belief in the soon coming of Christ. Ellen Harmon heard him in Portland, Maine, in March of 1840 when she was 12 years old. She recounted, “Mr. Miller traced down the prophecies with an exactness that struck conviction to the hearts of his hearers. He dwelt upon the prophetic periods, and brought many proofs to strengthen his position. Then his solemn and powerful appeals and admonitions to those who were unprepared, held the crowds as if spellbound.” *Life Sketches*, 20.

William Miller: 1782–1849.

WILLIAM MILLER'S TWO DREAM'S

The following is William Miller's first dream, with commentary concerning the meaning of the dream supplied by the pioneer David Arnold. Brother Arnold's comments were in brackets in the original, and I intend to retain the brackets **but also place his comments in bold-face type**. When Brother Arnold refers to publications, the names of the publications were originally placed in quotation marks. I have removed the quotation marks and simply italicized the publications. Any other any emphasis such as italics and capitalization was in the original.

I inserted the date 1855, for though we have not found the official date for the publication of this *Review and Herald Extra*; Miller's dream is identified as occurring in 1826 and in the article Brother Arnold marks that he is dealing with the dream 29 years after the fact. I therefore inserted the year of 1855. The final paragraph is included by the Editor of the *Review and Herald*, and was simply signed "W." in the original; therefore I concluded that the "W." represents James White, who was the editor during that era. I also removed all the commentary and included Miller's dream alone at the end of the article.

Jeff Pippenger

REVIEW AND HERALD—EXTRA 1855

Dream of William Miller

On the evening of the 4th of November, 1826, I sat up late, conversing with some friends on religious subjects, and about 12 o'clock I retired to rest. After some time, I fell asleep, and dreamed the following dream:

I thought I was in a barren uninhabited country, apparently between sundown and dark—neither night nor day. The air appeared rather chilly, but not so cold as mid-winter; but like its beginning.

[This represents the state of the Sardis church at that time in its transition state from being the light of the world to its present state of gross darkness, and its "mid-winter" of cold worldly conformity.]

I thought it stormed, but not severely; it appeared to me like a mixture of snow and rain. There appeared to be some wind, yet not a gale; and everything wore a gloomy aspect—yet I could not tell why. I seemed to be in danger—yet I knew of no danger.

[Storm, snow, rain and winds are used to represent perils, afflictions and judgments; here used to represent the perils, &c. of the second woe, which were not as severe as will be the stormy winds of the third woe, wrought up to a gale by the pouring out of the vials of wrath.— Brother Miller, although, then on the borders of perilous times, yet he "knew of no danger."]

I thought I had two companions: one a Baptist minister, the other a Universalist. They had hold one of each arm, and were compelling me to come along, as though we were in great danger, and were fleeing for life. After travelling a northern course for some time, I inquired where we were? They said: "Near home." I thought they then took an eastward course, and came to a little spot of woods, consisting of small evergreen trees, about fifteen foot high. They then let go of their hold on me, and lay down under these trees. I told them that I would not stay there.

[Whether these two companions represent the influences these two denominations exerted over him, or the resistance they rendered him, we have not at present the means of determining. We will however give an extract from the *Advent Shield*, number one, page 52, which may give the reader some light on this portion of the dream. "The rise of the Advent cause, as it has been developed by Mr. Miller, may be dated from A.D. 1831. For although he discovered his principles as early as 1818, it was not until 1831 that he first began to publish them abroad. His first step in this work was the publication of a series of articles on the subject of Christ's second coming, which appeared in the *Vermont Telegraph*, a Baptist paper published in Brandon, VT. Those articles were written to rid himself of the strong impression which followed him, that he must go and publish this thing to the world.

Another extract from *Life and Views*, page 57, we think shows where they let go of him and lay down. Speaking of the opposition he had met with he says, "And then to cap the climax of the arguments, a Reverend D. D. of the Baptist order cries out, '*Its all moonshine.*' Amen, says the Universalist minister."

The inquiry, "Where are we." And the reply, "Near home," will be easily explained, when we reflect that Brother Miller, at that time was inquiring what point of time we were occupying, and the reply of the churches, "near home," shows with what indefiniteness they viewed the subject. "Evergreen trees" represent ornament, shade, resting place. Here the churches satisfied with what is called orthodox theology, are disposed to rest, and give over the search for further light, and leave him to pursue his course alone. He, not satisfied to make one half the Bible a perfect mystery, purposes his course in search of light.]

I then started, and they followed. Our course was then circuitous, from west to south and east, through a barren, level country, with nothing to be seen but now and then a bush. After travelling for some time we came in sight of a row of lights in the night.

[Searching in different directions for light for some time, saw a row of lights. Here he discovered that Prophecy, History, the signs of the times, and the prophetic periods, viz. the metallic image, seven times, 2300 days, 1335, 1290, 1260, 42 months, and time, times and a half, in connection with the darkening of the Sun, Moon, and falling of the stars, &c. &c., all harmonize to show Christ's personal coming, and the end of all human kingdoms and governments were near.]

We started our course for the lights, and soon came to a highway, running north and south. While we consulting which road to take, there came down two women from the north, until they came against us. I then inquired of them where we were. They made no answer, but turned about and went back. I here left my companions and followed these woman.

[While he steers his course towards these lights he finds in his way a road travelled by two churches, Catholics and Protestants, crossing (or in opposition to,) the way which led to these lights. Here Brother Miller and his companions, who had followed on after, were consulting whether it was best to take the old beaten track of the churches, or still direct their course towards the newly discovered lights. At this point the churches present their opposition to the new theory, and Brother Miller inquires of them, "Where are we?" They were unable to give an answer, and therefore keep silence on this important subject, and turn away from the lights, and pursue their own course back towards the northern regions of coldness and death. Here, Brother Miller, meeting with such an army of opposition, and feeling his own weakness, and a strong reverence for the church, was induced to walk with them in their northern course.]

We had not gone far before we came to an old log house that stood by the wayside, into which they entered, and I followed, where I found a small fire, and attempted to warm myself; but while I was thus warming myself, seeing some suspicious looks in the countenances of those present, I cast my eye around to see the cause, and behold a great beast like a bear gnashing his teeth, and growling at me. I started back to the other side of the room at the sight. I looked, and saw a chain fastened to the logs of the house, and around his neck. I next saw a small dog, set on by one present, running around the bear, and barking at him. He soon caught the dog in his mouth, when a person present, in endeavoring to release the dog, got his hand caught between the teeth of the bear. I then looked for a weapon to relieve the person thus situated, and found a club almost three foot long, with which I struck the bear on the head and delivered the man. The bear then came at me, in a rage; the club now became a man's arm, with a hand having ten fingers, and those very long. With this I kept the bear off, and soon got out of the house and ran with all my might towards the north.

["Entering the old log house." House represents and organized structure designed for shelter. And old log house with fitly represent human creeds, and church organizations. In this miserable shelter he found himself cold, (a very natural state of joining a church,) and sought to warm himself by their "small fire." "Suspicious looks." With what suspicion did the priests, and the churches look upon Brother Miller, because he held forth the doctrine that the Bible actually taught the coming of Christ near, and that there was definiteness to the prophetic periods. "A great beast like a bear fasten to the logs growling and gnashing his teeth," is a clear representation of the opposition *fostered*, fed and *held* by the churches, against Brother Miller's theory, or any other theory not in accordance with their dogmas and creeds. Thus the Pharisaic church, because Stephen told them the truth, that pricked them in their hearts, gnashed upon him with their teeth. (How very like a bear.)

Under pagan Rome the bear was at liberty, and Stephen fell a martyr to his rapacity; but in Protestant America, the bear is chained. "A small dog worrying the bear." This scene of contention between the dog, the bear, the man and Brother Miller, taken in connection with its chronology, must represent scenes taking place in the church about that time. As the bear represents the spirit of oppression and priestly domination in the churches, the dog must represent a spirit or principle that would rouse up the opposing spirit of the churches, and cause it to gnash on all who dared oppose its authority.

We know of nothing at that time which drew out the hatred and malice of the churches more than the subject of the abolition of slavery. This being at that time pressed upon the consideration of the churches by those within her own pale, is fitly represented in the dream by setting on the dog by one present. The person caught in the teeth of the bear, in his efforts to deliver the dog, represents those persons in the churches who endeavor to justify and promote the principles of abolition and condemn slavery. For this merciful act, in favor of God given rights and condemning the unhallowed traffic of Babylon, in "slaves and souls of men," the bear gnashes upon them, and they are caught between his teeth. Brother Miller endeavoring to justify or release these, finds the malice and hatred of the churches directed against him, and his peculiar views, and is now under the necessity of acting in self-defense. His weapon or "club now became a man's arm, with a hand having ten fingers, and those very long." His releasing the man from the teeth of the bear may be explained on this wise. Those who heard Brother Miller's arguments, and saw their force, discovered that slavery would exist until God poured out his judgments on the woman, whose traffic is in slaves and souls of men. Therefore they saw that all their efforts to release the slaves would be of no avail. This delivered them from further contention with the churches on this subject.

The opposition of the churches was then more directly against Brother Miller and those who believed with him. While acting in self-defense his weapon, or arguments are represented by an arm; hand, and ten very long fingers, which bear fit resemblance to the fourth or Roman kingdom. The arm representing Rome before its division, and the fingers its divided state. Showing by authentic history, and present conditions of the Roman kingdom, that it has about measured off its prophetic length, constituted a prominent and conclusive argument in Brother Miller's theory, by which he defended his position against the attacks of church opposition.

By finding within the church such a settled hatred to his views, and feeling as it is expressed in the *Shield*, number 1, page 52, an inward monitor pressing him, saying, "Go and tell it to the world, or their blood will I require at thy hand," he left the old log house, and the scene of contention, and went single handed to proclaim to the world the evidence of its approaching doom. *Shield*, number 1, pages 52 and 53, says, "He continued to travel and lecture, as the Lord opened the way, for about six years, with few if any to take him by the hand and encourage him on in his great and arduous work." Truly this was like "climbing a steep hill."]

After climbing a steep hill until I was weary, I sat down, when a person came to me, and informed me if I would follow him he would lead me out of danger. I followed him, and after travelling uphill for some time, we came to a small house, where we went in, and found a number of women, spinning and making garments.

[Here Brother Miller, after struggling against opposition, and laboring for six years to warn the inhabitants of earth of the hour of judgment, and seeing but little fruit of his arduous toil, “became weary, and sat down.” Here an extract from *Shield*, number 1, page 58, will show clearly who it was that came to Brother Miller under these discouraging circumstances, and offered to be his guide.

“Under these repeated attacks, from pulpit and press, it was felt that some organ of communication should be opened, by which the public mind could be disabused in reference to the varied reports, which were circulated in reference to Mr. Miller and his views. He had long sought for someone to take the supervision of a paper, through which he could speak to the public; but such a man could not be found, who for love or money would undertake the task, and bear the scorn of an unbelieving world. At this juncture when the storm of opposition grew heavy, the providence of God raised up a man for this work also. That unwearied friend of the cause, J. V. Himes, who has so nobly stood in front of the host, and the hottest fire, came forward and threw himself into the enterprise, to make up the breach. On the 20th of March, 1840, without money, patrons or scarcely friends, he issued the first number of the *Signs of the Times.*” From this point the two struggled on against wind and tide, or “uphill,” until they came to a small house. This house represents the first Second Advent Conference. See *Shield*, number 1, page 60. “Up to this period, all that has been done was accomplished by individual effort. In this depression of affairs it was determined to hold a SECOND ADVENT CONFERENCE in Boston, where the friends of the cause could congregate, and give expression to their feelings, and put forth an effort to arouse the country and the world to a sense of its coming doom.— This meeting was assembled in Chardon Street Chapel, on the 15th of October, 1840, and continued two days.

This was styled “THE FIRST GENERAL CONFERENCE OF SECOND ADVENT BELIEVERS.” In this house, or body of believers, Brother Miller presented the warp, while members of the different churches (represented by the women,) spun and wove the filing, thus bringing together in harmonious arrangement, the scattered fragments of Advent truth to clothe those who would receive them, against the approaching storm.]

After some conversation, my guide told me I must go on.— We then went out, and followed the same northern course until we descended the hill, and came to a large, low, old house, where we went in, and saw a large number of people, of all ages and sexes. There appeared to be a man present, who went to each one of these, and whispered in their ears. All appeared solemn and silent.

[After the above Conference, Brother Miller was encouraged to pursue his course, which now was descending, a new impetus been given to the work. Here he came to a large, low, old house containing a number of people. Here is presented the condition of those to whom the everlasting gospel was preached. All were solemn and silent, while the Spirit was whispering the momentous truth in each ear. Here was the everlasting gospel preached unto them that dwell on the earth, to every nation, kindred, tongue and people.]

He came to me, and whispered in my ears, "Love God and your neighbor," and told me to remember it. I thought I had told him to write it on my heart. He said he would repeat it, and that I should not forget it. He did so, and left me. Here I had peculiar feelings. I found I had broken these two great commandments my whole life. It seemed as though I had never loved God or my neighbor. My whole life looked like a catalogue of crime; and if I ever had repentance, I had it there. (Oh, my God! Why not grant me such repentance when awake?) It was unmixed with any pride, or thoughts of carnal things. I remembered all my sins, as I thought, and they were exceedingly sinful. If David felt as I then did, I do not wonder that he cried out, "Against Thee, and Thee only, have I sinned." I thought that then my guide gave me a staff, and told me I must travel.

["Love God and your Neighbor." Here the Holy Spirit impressed Brother Miller with the importance of showing love to God, by faithfully proclaiming the important truths he had shown him, and love to his neighbor by warning them of the impending doom that awaited them. "A staff" represents a prop or support. The paper and other publications, issued from the press of J. V. Himes at that time, proved a great support to Brother Miller, while travelling, and proclaiming the everlasting gospel.]

I went out of the house, and looking every way, to see which way I should go, I saw to the northward many roads branching off different ways. While I was considering, I saw many people, young and old, come out of the house and run in these roads. I then saw the roads were wide, and well-trod. I then thought of the broad way mentioned in the Scriptures, and turned away, determining within myself not to go therein. I then looked to the south, and saw a few people come out of the house, and one by one take a south-east course, and follow each other in a direct line, until I lost sight of them.

[This house, as we have before shown, is the scene of preaching and hearing the everlasting gospel. The many broad and well-trodden roads towards the north, represent the many ways pursued by the thousands, who have listened to, and rejected the flying angel's message.— While that at the south marks the direction, and the path pursued by those who regarded the faithful servants cry, and went out to meet the bridegroom. In the one case all who reject the message, and regarded the cry of the unfaithful servant pursued the same course they did before. The different sects travelled the same broad beaten track, to which each had been accustomed. Thus each pursued his own chosen way, regardless of the all-important message.

On the other hand, here and there one leaves every other path, and steers his course in the direction of "the row of lights in the south-east." While these in obedience to the cry, "Come out of her my people," left the different church organizations, and sought for further light, Brother Miller slow to believe the second angel's message, lingered behind, until (as in the dream) "he lost sight of them."]

While I stood thinking of them, I heard a voice as from above, saying, "This is the way; walk ye in it." Although I saw no path, I followed the same course, and soon came to a straight way, cast up with two gulfs on either side. The path was marked with footsteps indented into the earth as deep as a shoe, and only wide enough for these tracts, one before the other, in a straight line.

[While Brother Miller was seeking to know what course to pursue, and thinking of the few who had come out of Babylon, (for there was a beginning to come out, even at this early date,) and were swiftly pursuing their course in the direction of “the row of light,” and fearing it was wrong to leave the churches, “hears a voice from above, saying, This is the way walk ye in it.” Although he saw no path, or no command, to come out, yet by obeying the injunction of the Holy Spirit to walk therein, he soon saw a plain path, and that it led between two gulfs, the world on one hand, and the professed church on the other hand, and that it was both straight and narrow. The tracts in a straight line represent the unity of walk by the travelers, and points of prophecy marking their course.]

I soon overtook some traveling the same road, and one old man, apparently ninety or one hundred years of age, bowed down to the earth and withered up. He appeared to be praising God that he had mercy on such an old, dry stick, while thousands younger were to go in the broad way. I thought my road became more rugged, although the steps continued.— When I came to any of these places, by setting my staff down it became long or short, as occasion might require, and I could step up or down with ease. My way was principally in the ascent until I came to a precipice. I could look down and see the steps below; but how to get down I could not tell. While standing here the voice again spake; “Pride must be humbled.” I then had a view of my own proud heart, and all my ways seemed as though they were full of that sin. Even my devotions were nothing but pride; and in the bitterness of my soul I cried out: “True, I am a proud haughty wretch!” I then put my staff down the precipice, and it became a guide pole, so that I by clasping both my hands around it, slipped down, slipped down, and then went on until I came to a low piece of wet ground.

[“Road more rugged, yet steps continued.” Difficulties and obstructions in the way, yet the steps, (prophetic fulfillments,) were plain.— “His staff, a help.” The paper, by condensing the light obtained by the research of different individuals, helped over these rugged steep places. “Came to a precipice.” This precipice represents the first point of expectation, spring 1843. But it was shown through the paper [staff,] that it took all the year 457 B.C. and all of 1843, to make full 2300 years. Therefore, by embracing it, or “clasping it with both hands,” he easily slid down to the “tracks below,” or points in prophecy, yet in the future. Here, also pride met with a rebuke.— “I then went on.” Here he found all right again, and went on as before in the clear light of prophecy, until he came to the close of the year 1843, Jewish reckoning, where he found himself in low, wet ground, representing an obstructed course, disappointment and humiliation. Here the vision tarried.]

Here I lost my tracks, and while I was looking to find my way, the voice I had heard before again spake: “The way is marked in blood.” I then felt surprised that I had not remembered it. I then looked around to find the blood, and looking a little way before me, I saw a rail fence, and stepping up to it, found a streak of blood from top to bottom, about two inches wide. I clasped my hands and cried, “This is the blood of my Saviour!” While in this situation I heard a voice as of a rushing wind. I looked up and there was a small cloud over my head; and it began to sprinkle like great drops of rain. I looked on my hands and clothes, and saw great drops of blood. I heard the voice saying: “This is the blood of sprinkling, that speaketh better things than the blood of Abel.”

I now had a view of the blood of Christ; its effects; and the great love wherewith he loved us. My mind, which all along had been more or less troubled, by fears and doubts, now became calm and serene, and like Job I could say, "I know my Redeemer liveth." My hard heart melted within me, and ran out with pure love to Christ.

While in this ecstasy of mind, I looked up and saw a beam of wood extending from east to west. I thought the voice said, "Behold the cross!" I again looked down, and was wondering within myself what these things could mean, when the voice said: "Garments rolled in blood." I again looked up, and saw as it had been a garment dipped in blood, hanging over the beam, fourteen or fifteen feet high.

My feelings while viewing these things I cannot describe; but it now became light, and I saw the sun as if about three hours high in the morning. I then traveled on the same straight way southeast, as before, with this difference—only the streak of blood now marked the path.

["Here I lost my tracks." By the passing of the year 1843, Jewish time, Brother Miller, with all Adventists, was disappointed, and lost "the tracks," or in other words, the prophetic path which appeared so plain before, now seemed hidden from sight. But soon the same voice from heaven which spoke before, was now heard directing through the typical services in the earthly sanctuary, to the antitypical, in the heavenly, which were all the way "marked with blood," and pointed to the day of atonement, and the true Sanctuary, which would be cleansed at the end of 2300 days. This cleansing could commence, according to the type, on no other day than the tenth of the seventh month, 1844, for the true point to look for the ending of the 2300 days, and the cleansing of the antitypical Sanctuary, coming of the Bridegroom before the Ancient of days, in the holiest of all, to be united to his kingdom, to whence the true saints are to "wait for his return from the wedding."

Now the tracts were plain again, and all was clear as before, save the difference, "The streak of blood now marked the path." "Felt surprised that I had not remembered it." To make this point clear we will refer you to *Advent Shield*, number 2, page 267. "The first public reference made to the seventh month, as the time of the Lord's Advent, was by Mr. Miller, in a letter which appeared in the *Signs of the Times* of May 17, 1843. In this letter he alluded to the various events which had occurred, and to the several observances of the Jewish law, which commenced in the seventh month. As many of these were typical of events predicted to transpire in immediate connection with the Second Advent, it was considered highly probable that in their antitypical fulfillment they might be fulfilled chronologically.—

Brother Miller quite forgot the arguments drawn from the types, until brought to his mind in the tarrying time. The rail fence, with a streak of blood from top to bottom, or from beginning to end.

“Heard a voice as of a rushing wind.” This marks the cry, “Behold the Bridegroom cometh, go ye out to meet him,” on the tenth of the seventh month, which went through the land “like a rushing wind.” “This is the blood of sprinkling, &c.” Here Brother Miller is brought to see and feel the effect which was to be produced in the Day of Atonement, upon all Israel, by the sprinkling of the blood of Christ, to cleanse the Sanctuary, and blot out all the sins of the people. “My mind which had all along been troubled, &c., now became calm and serene.” To show where this point in the dream became fulfilled, we will give an extract from a letter published in the *Advent Herald*, for October 16, 1844, just after Brother Miller discovered the “way marked in blood.”

“Oh the glory I have seen today. My brother, I thank God for this light, my soul is so full that I cannot write. My doubts and fears and darkness are all gone. (Sun has risen.) I see that we are yet right. God’s word is true and my soul is full of joy. Methinks I hear you say, Brother Miller is now a fanatic. Very well, call me what you please; I care not. Christ will come in the seventh month, and will bless us all.”]

After traveling some time I came to a large house. It now appeared to be night. I went in and saw many people there. The house extended from west to east, through the center of which was a long hall, lighted up with lamps on each side; and each side of this hall doors opened into small apartments like bedrooms. I found my former guide, who informed me I must travel through this hall. He also gave me a little book, and said that that would direct me. He then cautioned me to “beware of the buttry.” I put the book into my pocket and walked through. As I passed along, the doors on each side of the hall would open, and spirits, as it then appeared to me, would brush by me, and try to force me into these rooms. I kept right straight forward till I came to the east end of the room.

[“After traveling some time, (from whence he discovered that the streak of blood marked his path, to the Albany Conference,) I came to a larger house.” As the three houses previously seen in this dream, each represented an associated body of people, so also this house represents the whole body of Second Advent believers. Its several apartments, the different divisions into the whole house of Adventists became divided after the tenth day movement. “It now appeared to be night.” The gospel sun has now set, or the time of preaching the everlasting gospel to the Gentile world, had now closed, and darkness covered the earth.

“I went in and saw many people.” This we shall place at the “Albany Conference.” Where Brother Miller went in, and had a general view of the Advent people, as shown by representatives of the different churches. Here also he found his *former guide*, J. V. Himes, and received from him instructions, and a book guiding him through the *hall*. As this house represents the whole body of Advent believers, its apartments of necessity represents the divisions, or different systems of faith, received and advocated by that body.

Consequently the “Hall” must represent one peculiar system of Advent faith. And as we have before shown that J. V. Himes was Brother Miller’s “former guide,” and as he here in this hall *found his former guide*, who informed him that he *must travel through this hall*, we are forced to the conclusion that this hall represents that peculiar system of faith advocated by J. V. Himes, through which by skillful admonitions, he caused Brother Miller to pass, warning him against the reception of any other faith, except “The original faith,” as he was pleased to call it, or as he expressed it in other words, “The old Platform.” He also gave him a little book to guide him through this hall, or system of faith. This was the creed or discipline of the Laodicean church, or the circular sent out from the Albany Conference, containing the sayings and doings of that Conference, and its system of faith, in connection with its herding together of vital truths, and “unseemly practices,” and then holding the whole up to contempt and scorn. See said circular. “He then cautioned me to beware of the buttery.” A buttery is the only room in the house designed for the storage of food prepared for present use. Then the only conclusion that can be drawn from the facts before us is that all of the systems of Advent faith, but one is “*present truth*.” And against this system of faith more than all others, J. V. Himes warns Brother Miller to BEWARE. Of this buttery we will further speak in its proper place. “I put the book into my pocket.” That is, consented to receive it as his future guide, or system of faith. “Walked through.” Brother Miller passed through even to the door of death without fully receiving any other system of faith than J. V. Himes’ “*Original faith*.” Although other systems were forced upon his view, which was the spirits brushing by him, and trying to force him into different rooms, or systems of faith, such as Spiritualism, Snowism, &c. &c.]

Here I found two closed doors, and while I considering which door to enter, one of them opened and discovered to me a room filled with all the dainties which a man could wish to eat or drink: and some persons in the room invited me to enter. I was at a lost what to do; but remembering the caution I had, I put my hand in my pocket to find my little book. I pulled out one, and found it was not the same, and so I threw it down and pulled out two more, one after the other, and threw them down also.— I then pulled out the one that had been given to me, and, on opening it read Isaiah 48:17. Thus saith the Lord, thy Redeemer, the Holy One of Israel; I am the Lord thy God which teacheth thee to profit, which leadeth thee by the way that thou shouldst go. The other door then opened and I saw a dark winding stairway. On the bottom lay a young child. I took it up, and reached it back to some that stood behind me. They refused to take it. I then laid it down again, and stepped in.— All was dark and gloomy as the door of death. I remembered no more until I arrived at the top of the stairs, where I found myself, as I then thought, in an upper room, filled with the purest light that my eyes had ever beheld.

[“Two closed doors.” Here, Brother Miller, after passing by and rejecting the different systems of Advent faith presented to his view, and adhering closely in the creed of the Albany Conference, is finally brought to view the buttery, and dark gloomy door of death. At first his view is imperfect, or seemingly “closed,” but on a closer view all is revealed, or doors open. The Buttery is first presented to his view, where he sees as he expresses it “a room filled with all the dainties men could wish to eat or drink.”

The Buttery is one division of the Advent house. The rich provisions contained therein are the glorious truths held by that portion of the Advent people. The time in which Brother Miller was permitted to view these truths was just before his death; say in the year 1849. And of these truths, and this people, his guide J. V. Himes, specially warned him to beware.

Here the reader will doubtless inquire what portion of Advent believers are represented by the buttery, and, what are the truths held by them?

We would here say that at the end of the tenth of the seventh month 1844, the Advent people were one. But from this point they became divided into several divisions and sub-divisions, some of which received names as follows—Spiritualizers, Door-shutters, Herald party, &c. Up to the spring of '48 these parties were more or less changing, dividing and sub-dividing. At this point there had one party raised a prominent standard of truth, around which there has since been a gathering, and settling into a unity of faith and action. This division has received from their opponents the names of Door-shutters, Sabbath-keepers, Judaizers, &c. They have also associated them, and some of the Bible truths they hold, with all “fanaticism,” and “unseemly practices” of others, calling themselves Adventists, and then warned not only Brother Miller, but all others against associating with, or in any way fellowshiping with them. Thus they have fulfilled the prediction by Ezekiel 34:18–19. *Seemeth it a small thing unto you to have eaten up the good pasture, but ye must tread down with your feet the residue of your pastures? and to have drunk of the deep waters, but ye must foul the residue with your feet?*

And *as for MY FLOCK*, they eat that which ye have trodden with your feet; and they drink that which ye have fouled with your feet.

Our limits will not permit us to show up all the truths held by this portion of Advent believers.

We will, however, point out a few. We hold that the Divine hand has guided us through the proclamation of the everlasting gospel. Revelation 14:6–7, the second Angel’s message, “Babylon is fallen,” and that we are now in the third Angel’s message, “If any man worship the Beast,” &c, “The same shall drink the wine of the wrath of God,” &c., soon to be poured out, which will constitute the seven last plagues. That the law of Moses was abolished at the cross, but no part of the law of God, the ten commandments; consequently “The seventh day is the Sabbath of the Lord God.” That none can be said to be keeping the commandments of God, while they keep only nine of them. That the Sabbath is the “Seal of the living God.” That the 2300 days ended in the fall of '44, when our High Priest commenced the work of cleansing the heavenly Sanctuary, which is now in the process of cleansing. That at that point in time the time of the Gentiles was fulfilled. That then “the Bridegroom came” before the Ancient of days, to receive the Bride, the New Jerusalem, and that when he comes to gather the saints, He will “return from the wedding.” That the coming of Christ, and the literal resurrection of the righteous, will be after the seven last plagues are poured out. That “the dead know not anything,” and that the wicked shall be burned up root and branch—be as though they had not been. That the saints, after one thousand years from the resurrection of the righteous dead, shall inherit the earth, restored to its Eden state, forever and ever.

This is but a faint view of some of the rich provisions found in the BUTTERY,—sought out and set in order from the great storehouse of God’s word. Against this buttery J. V. Himes, and those who have apostatized from the true faith, as shown by the *Review*, have, for the last five of six years, been arraying their forces. But “he, who sees the end from the beginning,” more than 29 years since, saw fit to give Brother Miller, in a dream of the night, a representation of his course even to his entrance into the world of light and glory, and has permitted those who have proved traitors to his cause, and recreant to their trust, to publish their own condemnation. “Some persons in the room invited me to enter.” This no doubt represents his perusal of the books and papers setting forth the truths above hinted at. After getting a view of these truths, he says, “I was at a loss what to do, but remembering the caution I had,” &c. here Brother Miller saw the beauty of those truths, and while at a loss whether to embrace or reject them, he recollected the caution of his former guide and counselor, and as he sought to examine the creed of the Albany Conference again, there lay in his way, some two or three other systems of Advent faith which had been put in his possession while he had been passing through the hall, which he could but reject at first sight. At last looking at the one J. V. Himes gave him, “he read on top of the page,” (see the original dream written by Brother Miller in 1826,) Isaiah 48:17. Thus saith the Lord, thy Redeemer, the Holy One of Israel; I am the Lord thy God which teacheth thee to profit, which leadeth thee by the way that thou shouldst go. Here is embodied much of the sentiment of a few of the first articles of the Albany Conference creed, which in themselves considered, are not objectionable. But the trouble lies in not connecting with them those truths which constitute their vitality. So with this passage, when taken by itself, it speaks of a TEACHER. But it takes the next verse to finish the teaching. O that thou hadst HEARKENED to my COMMANDMENTS! then had thy peace been as a river, and thy righteousness as the waves of the sea. Isaiah 48:18. The Albany Conference embodied in their articles of faith some truth, and then condemned what Christ told the young man to do, if he would secure eternal life, viz. keeping of the commandments. They professed to be Israelites, and called “the Holy One of Israel,” their Redeemer, and claimed the right to regulate the faith of the church, and then by their “Resolutions” condemned the commandments of God, and the example of their Redeemer, and his chosen Apostles. Well may the Holy One of Israel say by the prophet, “O that thou hadst HEARKENED to my commandments.”

Thus those who had once stood in front of the battle, and nobly defended sustained Brother Miller in his declining age, and the cause of truth he had so long advocated, now assumed the reins of dictation, and by an undue use of the influence they had gained over Brother Miller, they caused him to refuse an entrance into the “Buttery,” where he might have partaken of “the bread which cometh down from heaven, that a man might eat thereof, and NOT DIE.”

But when Brother Miller was brought to view this bread of life, he remembered the caution of his FORMER GUIDE, refused to partake, and the door of death then opens, and presents to his view the “dark,” “gloomy,” *unconscious* passage from death to the glorious morn of the resurrection, to life and consciousness. Truly, as said the wise man, “The dead know not anything.” . . . Also their LOVE and their HATRED, and their ENVY, (qualities of the mind) is now PERISHED. Ecclesiastes 9:5–6. The young child which he discovered just after he saw that he must die, no doubt represents, as in the scriptures, a meek, child-like spirit, which in the sight of God is of great price. We have not a definite history of his last moments; but from the dream we should judge, that just before he entered the unconscious state, he was in the spirit which the Saviour represents by a little child. This finished his life of labor, of toil, and suffering, for the spiritual benefit of his fellow men. But the dream does not leave him in the dark gloomy passage, where there is no knowledge, no device, no love, no hatred, no blissful heaven, no burning hell. It bears him on through his unconscious sleep, to the morn, when the “trump of God” shall awaken him again to life, and usher him into that “upper room, filled with the purest light,” where he says:]

I looked for the cause—there was none—neither sun, nor moon, nor candle—the light was brighter than the brightest rays of the sun. Yet it did not dazzle—it was soft and easy to behold as the morning tints. The room appeared to be arched, yet I could not discover its height. The floor appeared like crystal glass, very thick, yet it did not restrain the sight, for I could see all below. The room extended from east to west. On each hand was a walk, on which I saw many walking. I was directed to talk with them when I found they were singing. The only words I could recollect were—“Hallelujah, to the Lamb.” The music was soft and sweet—it fell on the ear without any jar or pain. I beheld many persons that I knew,—the old man that I had seen before. I congratulated him on his safe arrival at last. I heard him sing. No silent ones there. I thought of the love they had one for another. I thought I felt its flame—its pure unadulterated love. No mixture of self beyond another. I saw all denominations of Christians, yet all distinctions were taken away.

Here was a communion indeed—here was no envy—no hatred—no selfish principles to build up—no evil thoughts—nothing to hurt or annoy. (Oh! Ye selfish votaries, could ye but see this happy throng, you would cover your faces with shame—you would hide yourselves, if possible, from the face of the Lamb, and Him that sitteth on the throne.) I felt myself free from every clay, and all my soul was swallowed up in this celestial throng. I then thought it was a dream—a slight and disagreeable feeling passed over my mind, to think that I must return and experience again the woes of life. I shuddered at the thought and then awoke. William Miller, 1826.

[Thus we have passed through this remarkable dream. Who save “He who sees the end from the beginning,” could point out with such precision, and chronological order, so many years previous to their fulfillment, a successive course of events, which have been fulfilled in perfect order in the experience of Brother Miller, even down to his death! Truly, He who anciently chose the medium of dreams and visions, to instruct and warn his people, and who promised to communicate to them in the “last days” through the same medium, has in this dream fulfilled in part that promise. But this vision of the night, like many of those given anciently, did not minister to him that saw it, but to us to whom the end of the world is to come.

This dream, like many of the prophecies, could not be explained until some of its main features were fulfilled, such as the division of the Advent house, the organization of the “Hall,” by the Albany Conference, the establishment of the buttery, and Brother Miller’s death. The evident design of this dream is to convince those who are in the Laodicean church, and have been deceived and led astray, as was Brother Miller by the cunning artifice of an exalted and fallen priesthood, led on by the “Idol Shepherd,” (whose fate you can read in Zechariah 10:17,) that they have been deceived by those professed shepherds, and warned against the reception of those truths, which constitute the present food for the true household of faith. Also to strengthen and encourage all who have entered the Buttery or enlisted under the true standard, “THE COMMANDMENTS OF GOD, AND THE TESTIMONY OF JESUS.” The dream also shows conclusively that God’s hand has been in the Advent movement, and that he will bring out a people rejected of men, but chosen of God and precious.] David Arnold

We have understood that Brother Miller considered this dream as marking out the most important events in his experience, while connected with the Advent cause. It has been considered of sufficient importance to have a place in the columns of the *Advent Herald*, and, *Advent Harbinger*. Those who have published it to the world, should not therefore, object to its appearance in this form, though they may not agree with all the remarks of Brother Arnold. If it is worth publishing, its true meaning is worth seeking for. Let it be understood that we do not publish this little work as an argument for our position. That rests upon the word of God. But he “that hath a dream, let him tell a dream,” and we know not why its meaning may not also be pointed out, for the comfort of the saints.

James White, 1855.

WILLIAM MILLER'S FIRST DREAM (NO COMMENTARY)

On the evening of the 4th of November, 1826, I sat up late, conversing with some friends on religious subjects, and about 12 o'clock I retired to rest. After some time, I fell asleep, and dreamed the following dream:

I thought I was in a barren uninhabited country, apparently between sundown and dark—neither night nor day. The air appeared rather chilly, but not so cold as mid-winter; but like its beginning.

I thought it stormed, but not severely; it appeared to me like a mixture of snow and rain. There appeared to be some wind, yet not a gale; and everything wore a gloomy aspect—yet I could not tell why. I seemed to be in danger—yet I knew of no danger.

I thought I had two companions: one a Baptist minister, the other a Universalist. They had hold one of each arm, and were compelling me to come along, as though we were in great danger, and were fleeing for life. After travelling a northern course for some time, I inquired where we were? They said: "Near home." I thought they then took an eastward course, and came to a little spot of woods, consisting of small evergreen trees, about fifteen feet high. They then let go of their hold on me, and lay down under these trees. I told them that I would not stay there.

I then started, and they followed. Our course was then circuitous, from west to south and east, through a barren, level country, with nothing to be seen but now and then a bush. After travelling for some time we came in sight of a row of lights in the night.

We started our course for the lights, and soon came to a highway, running north and south. While we consulting which road to take, there came down two women from the north, until they came against us. I then inquired of them where we were. They made no answer, but turned about and went back. I here left my companions and followed these woman.

We had not gone far before we came to an old log house that stood by the wayside, into which they entered, and I followed, where I found a small fire, and attempted to warm myself; but while I was thus warming myself, seeing some suspicious looks in the countenances of those present, I cast my eye around to see the cause, and behold a great beast like a bear gnashing his teeth, and growling at me. I started back to the other side of the room at the sight. I looked, and saw a chain fastened to the logs of the house, and around his neck. I next saw a small dog, set on by one present, running around the bear, and barking at him. He soon caught the dog in his mouth, when a person present, in endeavoring to release the dog, got his hand caught between the teeth of the bear. I then looked for a weapon to relieve the person thus situated, and found a club almost three foot long, with which I struck the bear on the head and delivered the man. The bear then came at me, in a rage; the club now became a man's arm, with a hand having ten fingers, and those very long. With this I kept the bear off, and soon got out of the house and ran with all my might towards the north.

After climbing a steep hill until I was weary, I sat down, when a person came to me, and informed me if I would follow him he would lead me out of danger. I followed him, and after travelling uphill for some time, we came to a small house, where we went in, and found a number of women, spinning and making garments.

After some conversation, my guide told me I must go on.— We then went out, and followed the same northern course until we descended the hill, and came to a large, low, old house, where we went in, and saw a large number of people, of all ages and sexes. There appeared to be a man present, who went to each one of these, and whispered in their ears. All appeared solemn and silent.

He came to me, and whispered in my ears, “Love God and your neighbor,” and told me to remember it. I thought I had told him to write it on my heart. He said he would repeat it, and that I should not forget it. He did so, and left me. Here I had peculiar feelings. I found I had broken these two great commandments my whole life. It seemed as though I had never loved God or my neighbor. My whole life looked like a catalogue of crime; and if I ever had repentance, I had it there. (Oh, my God! Why not grant me such repentance when awake?) It was unmixed with any pride, or thoughts of carnal things. I remembered all my sins, as I thought, and they were exceedingly sinful. If David felt as I then did, I do not wonder that he cried out, “Against Thee, and Thee only, have I sinned.” I thought that then my guide gave me a staff, and told me I must travel.

I went out of the house, and looking every way, to see which way I should go, I saw to the northward many roads branching off different ways. While I was considering, I saw many people, young and old, come out of the house and run in these roads. I then saw the roads were wide, and well-trod. I then thought of the broad way mentioned in the Scriptures, and turned away, determining within myself not to go therein. I then looked to the south, and saw a few people come out of the house, and one by one take a south-east course, and follow each other in a direct line, until I lost sight of them.

On the other hand, here and there one leaves every other path, and steers his course in the direction of “the row of lights in the south-east.” While these in obedience to the cry, “Come out of her my people,” left the different church organizations, and sought for further light, Brother Miller slow to believe the second angel’s message, lingered behind, until (as in the dream) “he lost sight of them.”]

While I stood thinking of them, I heard a voice as from above, saying, “This is the way; walk ye in it.” Although I saw no path, I followed the same course, and soon came to a straight way, cast up with two gulfs on either side. The path was marked with footsteps indented into the earth as deep as a shoe, and only wide enough for these tracts, one before the other, in a straight line.

I soon overtook some traveling the same road, and one old man, apparently ninety or one hundred years of age, bowed down to the earth and withered up. He appeared to be praising God that he had mercy on such an old, dry stick, while thousands younger were to go in the broad way. I thought my road became more rugged, although the steps continued.

When I came to any of these places, by setting my staff down it became long or short, as occasion might require, and I could step up or down with ease. My way was principally in the ascent until I came to a precipice. I could look down and see the steps below; but how to get down I could not tell. While standing here the voice again spake; "Pride must be humbled." I then had a view of my own proud heart, and all my ways seemed as though they were full of that sin. Even my devotions were nothing but pride; and in the bitterness of my soul I cried out: "True, I am a proud haughty wretch!" I then put my staff down the precipice, and it became a guide pole, so that I by clasping both my hands around it, slipped down, slipped down, and then went on until I came to a low piece of wet ground.

Here I lost my tracks, and while I was looking to find my way, the voice I had heard before again spake: "The way is marked in blood." I then felt surprised that I had not remembered it. I then looked around to find the blood, and looking a little way before me, I saw a rail fence, and stepping up to it, found a streak of blood from top to bottom, about two inches wide. I clasped my hands and cried, "This is the blood of my Saviour!" While in this situation I heard a voice as of a rushing wind. I looked up and there was a small cloud over my head; and it began to sprinkle like great drops of rain. I looked on my hands and clothes, and saw great drops of blood. I heard the voice saying: "This is the blood of sprinkling, that speaketh better things than the blood of Abel." I now had a view of the blood of Christ; its effects; and the great love wherewith he loved us. My mind, which all along had been more or less troubled, by fears and doubts, now became calm and serene, and like Job I could say, "I know my Redeemer liveth." My hard heart melted within me, and ran out with pure love to Christ. While in this ecstasy of mind, I looked up and saw a beam of wood extending from east to west. I thought the voice said, "Behold the cross!" I again looked down, and was wondering within myself what these things could mean, when the voice said: "Garments rolled in blood." I again looked up, and saw as it had been a garment dipped in blood, hanging over the beam, fourteen or fifteen feet high.

My feelings while viewing these things I cannot describe; but it now became light, and I saw the sun as if about three hours high in the morning. I then traveled on the same straight way southeast, as before, with this difference—only the streak of blood now marked the path.

After traveling some time I came to a large house. It now appeared to be night. I went in and saw many people there. The house extended from west to east, through the center of which was a long hall, lighted up with lamps on each side; and each side of this hall doors opened into small apartments like bedrooms. I found my former guide, who informed me I must travel through this hall. He also gave me a little book, and said that that would direct me. He then cautioned me to "beware of the buttry."

I put the book into my pocket and walked through. As I passed along, the doors on each side of the hall would open, and spirits, as it then appeared to me, would brush by me, and try to force me into these rooms. I kept right straight forward till I came to the east end of the room.

Here I found two closed doors, and while I considering which door to enter, one of them opened and discovered to me a room filled with all the dainties which a man could wish to eat or drink: and some persons in the room invited me to enter. I was at a lost what to do; but remembering the caution I had, I put my hand in my pocket to find my little book. I pulled out one, and found it was not the same, and so I threw it down and pulled out two more, one after the other, and threw them down also.— I then pulled out the one that had been given to me, and, on opening it read Isaiah 48:17. Thus saith the Lord, thy Redeemer, the Holy One of Israel; I am the Lord thy God which teacheth thee to profit, which leadeth thee by the way that thou shouldst go. The other door then opened and I saw a dark winding stairway. On the bottom lay a young child. I took it up, and reached it back to some that stood behind me. They refused to take it. I then laid it down again, and stepped in.— All was dark and gloomy as the door of death. I remembered no more until I arrived at the top of the stairs, where I found myself, as I then thought, in an upper room, filled with the purest light that my eyes had ever beheld.

I looked for the cause—there was none—neither sun, nor moon, nor candle—the light was brighter than the brightest rays of the sun. Yet it did not dazzle—it was soft and easy to behold as the morning tints. The room appeared to be arched, yet I could not discover its height. The floor appeared like crystal glass, very thick, yet it did not restrain the sight, for I could see all below. The room extended from east to west. On each hand was a walk, on which I saw many walking. I was directed to talk with them when I found they were singing. The only words I could recollect were—“Hallelujah, to the Lamb.” The music was soft and sweet—it fell on the ear without any jar or pain. I beheld many persons that I knew,—the old man that I had seen before. I congratulated him on his safe arrival at last. I heard him sing. No silent ones there. I thought of the love they had one for another. I thought I felt its flame—its pure unadulterated love. No mixture of self beyond another. I saw all denominations of Christians, yet all distinctions were taken away. Here was a communion indeed—here was no envy—no hatred—no selfish principles to build up—no evil thoughts—nothing to hurt or annoy. (Oh! Ye selfish votaries, could ye but see this happy throng, you would cover your faces with shame—you would hide yourselves, if possible, from the face of the Lamb, and Him that sitteth on the throne.) I felt myself free from every clay, and all my soul was swallowed up in this celestial throng. I then thought it was a dream—a slight and disagreeable feeling passed over my mind, to think that I must return and experience again the woes of life. I shuddered at the thought and then awoke.

William Miller, 1826.

WILLIAM MILLER'S SECOND DREAM

"I dreamed that God, by an unseen hand, sent me a curiously wrought **casket** about ten inches long by six square, made of ebony and pearls curiously inlaid. To the casket there was a **key** attached. I immediately took the **key** and opened the **casket**, when, to my wonder and surprise, I found it filled with all sorts and sizes of **jewels**, diamonds, precious stones, and gold and silver coin of every dimension and value, beautifully arranged in their several places in the casket; and thus arranged they reflected a light and glory equaled only to the sun.

"I thought it was not my duty to enjoy this wonderful sight alone, although my heart was overjoyed at the brilliancy, beauty, and value of its contents. I therefore placed it on a center table in my room and gave out word that all who had a desire might come and see the most glorious and brilliant sight ever seen by man in this life.

"The people began to come in, at first few in number, but increasing to a crowd. When they first looked into the casket, they would wonder and **shout for joy**. But when the spectators increased, everyone would begin to trouble the **jewels, taking them out of the casket and scattering them on the table**. I began to think that the owner would require the casket and the **jewels** again at my hand; and if I suffered them to be **scattered**, I could never place them in their places in the **casket** again as before; and felt I should never be able to meet the accountability, for it would be immense. I then began to plead with the people not to handle them, nor to take them out of the casket; but the more I pleaded, the more they scattered; and now they seemed to scatter them all over the room, on the floor and on every piece of furniture in the room.

"I then saw that among the genuine jewels and coin they had **scattered** an innumerable quantity of spurious jewels and counterfeit coin. I was highly incensed at their base conduct and ingratitude, and reprovved and reproached them for it; but the more I reprovved, the more they **scattered** the spurious jewels and false coin among the genuine.

"I then became vexed in my physical soul and began to use physical force to push them out of the room; but while I was pushing out one, three more would enter and bring in dirt and shavings and sand and all manner of rubbish, until they covered every one of the true jewels, diamonds, and coins, which were all excluded from sight. They also tore in pieces my casket and scattered it among the rubbish. I thought no man regarded my sorrow or my anger. **I became wholly discouraged and disheartened, and sat down and wept.**

"While I was thus weeping and mourning for my great loss and accountability, I remembered God, and earnestly prayed that He would send me help. Immediately the door opened, and a man entered the room, when the people all left it; and he, having a dirt brush in his hand, opened the windows, and began to brush the dirt and rubbish from the room.

"I cried to him to forbear, for there were some precious jewels **scattered** among the rubbish.

"He told me to 'fear not,' for he would 'take care of them.'

“Then, while he brushed **the dirt and rubbish, false jewels and counterfeit coin**, all rose and went out of the window like a cloud, and the wind carried them away. In the bustle **I closed my eyes for a moment**; when I opened them, the **rubbish** was all gone. The precious **jewels**, the diamonds, the gold and silver coins, lay scattered in profusion all over the room.

“He then placed on the table a casket, much larger and more beautiful than the former, and **gathered** up the **jewels**, the diamonds, the coins, by the handful, and cast them into the casket, till not one was left, although some of the diamonds were not bigger than the point of a pin.

“He then called upon me to ‘come and see.’

“I looked into the **casket**, but my eyes were dazzled with the sight. They shone with ten times their former glory. I thought they had been scoured in the sand by the feet of those wicked persons who had scattered and trod them in the dust. They were arranged in beautiful order in the casket, every one in its place, without any visible pains of the man who cast them in. **I shouted with very joy, and that shout awoke me.**” *Early Writings*, 81–83.

WILLIAM MILLER’S SECOND DREAM WITH COMMENTARY BY JAMES WHITE

The following dream was published in the *Advent Herald*, more than two years since. I then saw that it clearly marked out our past Second Advent experience, and that God gave the dream for the benefit of the scattered flock.

Among the signs of the near approach of the great and the terrible day of the Lord, God has placed dreams. See Joel 2:28–31; Acts 2:17–20. Dreams may come in three ways; first, ‘through the multitude of business.’ See Eccl.5:3. Second, those who are under the foul spirit and deception of Satan, may have dreams through his influence. See Deuteronomy 8:1–5; Jeremiah 23:25–28; 27:9; 29:8; Zechariah 10:2; Jude 8. And third, God has always taught, and still teaches his people more or less by dreams, which come through the agency of angels and the Holy Spirit. Those who stand in the clear light of truth will know when God gives them a dream; and such will not be deceived and led astray by false dreams.

‘And he said, Hear now my words; if there be a prophet among you, I the Lord will make myself known unto him in a vision, and will speak unto him in a dream.’ Numbers 12:6. Said Jacob, ‘The angel of the Lord spake unto me in a dream.’ Genesis 31:2. ‘And God came to Laban the Syrian in a dream by night.’ Genesis 31:24. Read the dreams of Joseph, [Genesis 37:5—9], and then the interesting story of their fulfilment in Egypt. ‘In Gibeon the Lord appeared to Solomon in a dream by night.’ 1 Kings 3:5. The great important image of the second chapter of Daniel was given in a dream, also the four beasts, etc. of the seventh chapter. When Herod sought to destroy the infant Saviour Joseph was warned in a dream to flee into Egypt. Matthew 2:13.

‘And it shall come to pass in the LAST DAYS, saith God, I will pour out of my Spirit upon all flesh: and your sons and your daughters shall prophesy, and your young men shall see visions, and your old men shall dream dreams.’ Acts 2:17.

The gift of prophecy, by dreams and visions, is here the fruit of the Holy Spirit, and in the last days is to be manifested sufficiently to constitute a sign. It is one of the gifts of the gospel church.

‘And he gave some apostles; and some PROPHETS; and some evangelists; and some pastors and teachers; For the perfecting of the saints, for the work of the ministry, for the edifying of the body of Christ.’ Ephesians 4:11–12.

‘And God hath set some in the church, first apostles, secondarily PROPHETS,’ etc. 1 Corinthians 12:28. ‘Despise not PROPHECYINGS.’ Thessalonians 5:20. See also Acts 13:1; 21:9; Romans 7:6; 1 Corinthians 14:1, 24, 39. Prophets or prophesyings are for the edification of the church of Christ; and there is no evidence that can be produced from the word of God, that they were to cease before evangelists, pastors and teachers were to cease. But says the objector, ‘There has been so many false visions and dreams that I cannot have confidence in anything of the kind.’ It is true that Satan has his counterfeit. He always had false prophets, and certainly we may expect them now in this his last hour of deception and triumph. Those who reject such special revelations because the counterfeit exists, may with equal propriety go a little farther and deny that God ever revealed himself to man in a dream or a vision, for the counterfeit always existed.

Dreams and visions are the medium through which God has revealed himself to man. Through this medium he spake to the prophets; he has placed the gift of prophecy among the gifts of the gospel church, and has classed dreams and visions with the other signs of the ‘LAST DAYS.’ Amen.

My object in the above remarks has been to remove objections in a scriptural manner, and prepare the mind of the reader for the following:

William Miller’s Second Dream

I dreamed that God, by an unseen hand, sent me a curiously wrought casket, (1) about ten inches long by six square, made of ebony and pearls curiously inlaid. To the casket there was a key (2) attached. I immediately took the key and opened the casket, when, to my wonder and surprise, I found it filled with all sorts and sizes of jewels, (3) diamonds, precious stones, and gold and silver coin of every dimension and value, beautifully arranged in their several places in the casket; and thus arranged they reflected a light and glory equaled only by the sun.

I thought it was my duty not to enjoy this wonderful sight alone, although my heart was overjoyed at the brilliancy, beauty and value of its contents. I therefore placed it on a centre-table in my room, and gave out word that all who had a desire might come and see the most glorious and brilliant sight ever seen by man in this life. The people began to come in, at first few in number, but increasing to a crowd. (4) When they first looked into the casket they would wonder, and shout for joy. But when the spectators increased, everyone would begin to trouble the jewels, taking them out of the casket and scattering (5) them on the table. At this time I began to think the owner would require the casket and jewels again at my hand; and if I suffered them to be scattered, I could never place them in their places in the casket again as before: and I felt I should never be able to meet the accountability, for it would be immense. I then began to plead with the people not to handle them, nor take them out of the casket; (6) but the more I plead, the more they scattered; and now they seemed to scatter them all over the room, on the floor, and on every piece of furniture in the room. I now saw that among the genuine jewels and coin they had scattered an innumerable quantity of spurious jewels and counterfeit coin. I was highly incensed at their base conduct and ingratitude, and reprov'd and reproach'd them for it; but the more I reproach'd, the more they scattered the spurious jewels and false coin among the genuine.

I then became vexed in my very soul, and began to use physical force to push them out of the room; but while I was pushing out one, three more would enter, and bring in dirt, and shavings, and sand, and all manner of rubbish, (7) until they covered every one of the true jewels, diamonds and coins - until they were all excluded from sight. They also tore in pieces my casket, (8) and scattered it among the rubbish. I thought no man regarded my sorrow or my anger. I became wholly discouraged and disheartened, and sat down and wept. While I was thus weeping and mourning for my great loss and accountability, I remembered God, and earnestly prayed that he would send me help. Immediately the door opened, and a man entered the room, when the people left it; and he, having a dirt-brush (9) in his hand, opened the windows, and began to brush the dust and rubbish from the room. I cried to him to forbear, for there were some precious jewels scattered among the rubbish. He told me to ‘fear not,’ for he would ‘take care of them.’

Then, while he brushed, the dust and rubbish, false jewels and counterfeit coin, all rose and went out of the windows like a cloud, and the wind carried them away. In the bustle I closed my eyes (10) for a moment; when I opened them, the rubbish was all gone. The precious jewels, the diamonds, gold and silver coins lay scattered in profusion over all the room. He then placed on the table a casket much larger and more beautiful than the former, and gathered up the jewels, the diamonds, the coins, by the handfuls, and cast them into the casket, till not one was left, although some of the diamonds were not bigger than the point of a pin.

He then called upon me, to ‘come and see.’ I looked into the casket, but my eyes were dazzled with the sight. They shone with ten times their former glory. I thought they had been scoured in the sand by the feet of those wicked persons who had scattered them, and trod them in the dust. I saw they were arranged in beautiful order in the casket, everyone in its place, without any visible pains of the man who cast them in. I shouted with very joy—and that shout awakened me.

The effect of this on my mind has been extremely consoling and happy.

William Miller, Low Hampton, N. Y. December 3, 1847.

Footnotes:

“1. The ‘casket’ represents the great truths of the Bible, relative to the second advent of our Lord Jesus Christ, which were given Bro. Miller to publish to the world.

“2. The ‘key attached’ was his manner of interpreting the prophetic Word—Comparing scripture with scripture—the Bible its own interpreter. With this key Brother Miller opened the ‘casket,’ or the great truth of the advent to the world.

“3. The ‘jewels, diamonds, etc.’ of ‘all sorts and sizes’ so ‘beautifully arranged in their several places in the casket’ represent the children of God, [Malachi 3:17,] from all the churches, and from almost every station, and situation of life, who received the advent faith, and were seen to take a bold stand in their several stations, in the holy cause of truth. While moving in this order, each attending to his own duty, and walking humbly before God, ‘they reflected a light and glory’ to the world, equaled only by the church in the days of the apostles. The message, [Revelation 14:6,7,] went as it were, upon the wings of the wind, and the invitation, ‘Come, for all things are now ready,’ [Luke 14:17.] went abroad with power and effect.

“4. ‘The people began to come in, at first few in number, but increased to a crowd.’ When the advent doctrine was first preached by Brother Miller, and a very few others, it had but little effect, and but very few were waked up by it; but from 1840 to 1844, wherever it was preached, the whole community was aroused.

“5. When the flying angel [Revelation 14:6–7] first began to preach the everlasting good news, ‘Fear God, and give glory to him; for the hour of his judgment is come,’ many shouted for joy in view of the coming of Jesus, and the restitution, who afterwards opposed and scoffed and ridiculed the truth that a little before filled them with joy. They troubled and scattered the jewels. This brings us to the autumn of 1844, when the scattering time commenced.

Mark this: It was those who once ‘shouted for joy’ that troubled and scattered the jewels. And none have so effectually scattered the flock, and led them astray since 1844, as those who once preached the truth, and rejoiced in it; but have since denied the work of God, and the fulfillment of prophecy in our past advent experience.

“6. The ‘spurious jewels and counterfeit coin’ that were scattered among the genuine, clearly represent false converts, or ‘strange children,’ [Hosea 5:7] since the door was shut in 1844.

“7. The ‘dirt and shavings, sand and all manner of rubbish,’ represent the various and numerous errors that have been brought in among second advent believers, since the autumn of 1844. Here I will notice a few of them.

1. The stand that some of the ‘shepherds’ presumptuously took immediately after the Midnight cry was given, that the solemn melting power of the Holy Ghost that attended the seventh month movement was a mesmeric influence. George Storrs was among the first to take this stand. See his writings in the latter part of 1844, in the *Midnight-Cry*, then published in New York City. J. V. Himes, at the Albany Conference in the spring of 1845, said that the seventh month movement produced mesmerism seven feet deep. This I am told by one who was present, and heard the remark. Others who took an active part in the seventh month cry, have since pronounced that movement the work of the Devil. Attributing the work of Christ and the Holy Ghost to the Devil was in the days of our Savior, blasphemy, and it is blasphemy now. 2. The many experiments on definite time. Since the 2300 days ended in 1844, quite a number of times have been set, by different individuals, for their termination. In doing this they have removed the ‘landmarks,’ and have thrown darkness and doubt over the whole advent movement. 3. Spiritualism with all its fancies and extravagances. This wile of the Devil, which has accomplished an awful work of death, is very fitly represented by ‘shavings,’ and ‘all manner of rubbish.’ Many of those who drank down the poison of spiritualism admitted the truth of our past advent experience, and from this fact many have been made to believe that spiritualism was the natural fruit of believing that God conducted the great advent movements in 1843 and 1844. Peter, speaking of those who should ‘bring in damnable heresies, even denying the Lord that bought them,’ says ‘BY REASON OF WHOM THE WAY OF TRUTH SHALL BE EVIL SPOKEN OF.’ 4. S. S. Snow professing to be ‘Elijah the Prophet.’ This man in his strange and wild career, has also acted his part in this work of death, and his course has had a tendency to bring the true position for the waiting saints into disrepute, in the minds of many honest souls.

To this catalogue of errors I might add many more, such as the ‘thousand years’ of Revelation 20:4, 7, in the past, the 144,000 of Revelation 7:4; 14:1, those who ‘arose and came out of the graves’ after Christ’s resurrection, the no-work doctrine, the doctrine of the destruction of infants, etc. etc. These errors were so industriously propagated, and urged upon the waiting flock that, at the time Brother Miller had the dream the true jewels were ‘excluded from sight,’ and the words of the prophet were applicable—‘And judgment is turned away backward, and justice standeth afar off,’ etc. etc. See Isaiah 56:14.

At that time there was not an advent paper in the land that advocated the cause of present truth. The ‘Day-Dawn,’ was the last to defend the true position of the little flock; but that died a number of months before the Lord gave Brother Miller this dream; and in its last dying struggle pointed the weary sighing saints to 1877, then thirty years in the future, as the time of their final deliverance. Alas! alas! No wonder that Brother Miller in his dream, ‘sat down and wept’ over this sad state of things.

“8. The casket, (See first note on first page) represents the advent truth that Brother Miller published to the world, as is marked out by the parable of the ten virgins. Matthew 25:1–11. First the time, 1843, second, the tarrying time, third the midnight cry, at the seventh month, 1844, and fourth, the shut door. No one who has read the Second Advent papers since 1843, will deny that Bro. Miller has advocated these four important points in advent history. This harmonious system of truth or ‘casket’ has been torn in pieces, and scattered among the rubbish by those who have rejected their own experience, and have denied the very truths that they, with Brother Miller so fearlessly preached to the world.

“9. The man with the ‘dirt-brush’ represents the clear light of present truth, as brought to view by the third angel’s message, [Revelation 14:9–12,] which is now purging the errors away from the remnant. The cause of present truth began to revive in the spring of 1848, and has been rising and gaining strength from that time to the present. The ‘dirt-brush’ has been moving, and the errors have been passing away before the clear light of truth, and some of the precious jewels, who but a short time since were covered up and excluded from sight by darkness and error, now stand in the clear light of present truth.

This work of bringing out the jewels, and purging away error is fast increasing, and is destined to move on with increasing power, until the saints are all searched out, and receive the seal of the living God. Compare this with the thirty-fourth chapter of Ezekiel, and you will see that God has promised to gather his flock that have been scattered in this dark and cloudy day, since 1844. Before Jesus comes, the ‘little flock’ will be gathered into the ‘unity of the faith.’ Jesus is now purifying ‘unto himself a peculiar people, zealous of good works,’ and when he comes he will find his ‘church not having spot, or wrinkle, or any such thing.’ ‘Whose fan is in his hand, and he will thoroughly purge his floor, and gather his wheat into the garner, etc.’ Matthew 3:12.

“10. The second ‘casket much larger and more beautiful than the former’ into which the scattered ‘jewels,’ ‘diamonds’ and coins were gathered, represents the broad field of living present truth into which the scattered flock will be gathered, even 144,000, all of them having the seal of the living God. Not one of the precious diamonds will be left in the dark. Although some are not bigger than the point of a pin, they will not be overlooked, and left out in this day when God is making up his jewels. [Malachi 3:16–18] He can send his angels and haste them out as he did Lot out of Sodom. ‘A short work will the Lord make upon the earth.’ ‘He will cut it short in righteousness.’ See Romans 9:28.”

James White, *Footnotes to Brother Miller’s Dream*.

Current Commentary on Miller’s Second Dream *Early Writings, 81–83.*

“I dreamed that God, by an unseen hand, sent me a curiously wrought casket about ten inches long by six square, made of ebony and pearls curiously inlaid.”

The casket represents the Bible, God’s word. The “casket” is six, by six, by ten which equals three hundred and sixty, thus representing the year/day principle—the primary rule of prophetic interpretation adopted by Miller and his associates.

“To the casket there was a key attached.”

The key is the rules of prophetic interpretation adopted by Miller and his associates.

“I immediately took the key and opened the casket, when, to my wonder and surprise, I found it filled with all sorts and sizes of jewels, diamonds, precious stones, and gold and silver coin of every dimension and value, beautifully arranged in their several places in the casket; and thus arranged they reflected a light and glory equaled only to the sun.”

The jewels represent the truths of God’s word that Miller was used to recognize and organize into the foundational truths of Adventism as represented upon the 1843 pioneer chart.

“I thought it was not my duty to enjoy this wonderful sight alone, although my heart was overjoyed at the brilliancy, beauty, and value of its contents.

Miller, as identified by Sister White was the “chosen one” to recognize, assemble and present the prophetic truths which are represented by the first angel’s message of Revelation fourteen.

“I therefore placed it on a center table in my room and gave out word that all who had a desire might come and see the most glorious and brilliant sight ever seen by man in this life.”

Miller fulfilled his work by presenting these great truths to all who would hear. Those truths were eventually placed upon Habakkuk’s first table, the 1843 chart. The desire for all to “come and see” is a direct reference to the call given in

Revelation as the seals are removed from the Book (the Bible) that was sealed with seven seals.

“The people began to come in, at first few in number, but increasing to a crowd.”

Initially Miller’s success was limited, but in 1840 his message was confirmed by the fulfillment of the prophecy of Revelation 9:14–15; and then the first angel’s message was carried to every mission station in the world.

“When they first looked into the casket, they would wonder and shout for joy.”

Miller’s message swelled into the Midnight Cry of 1844.

“But when the spectators increased, everyone would begin to trouble the jewels, taking them out of the casket and **scattering** them on the table.”

In 1863 the scattering of the foundational truths organized and presented by William Miller commenced with the setting aside of the first jewel that was discovered by Miller—the seven times of Leviticus 26.

“I began to think that the owner would require the casket and the jewels again at my hand; and if I suffered them to be **scattered**, I could never place them in their places in the casket again as before; and felt I should never be able to meet the accountability, for it would be immense. I then began to plead with the people not to handle them, nor to take them out of the casket; but the more I pleaded, the more they **scattered**; and now they seemed to **scatter** them all over the room, on the floor and on every piece of furniture in the room.

“I then saw that among the genuine jewels and coin they had **scattered** an innumerable quantity of spurious jewels and counterfeit coin. I was highly incensed at their base conduct and ingratitude, and reprovved and reproached them for it; but the more I reprovved, the more they **scattered** the spurious jewels and false coin among the genuine.

“I then became vexed in my physical soul and began to use physical force to push them out of the room; but while I was pushing out one, three more would enter and bring in dirt and shavings and sand and all manner of rubbish, until they covered every one of the true jewels, diamonds, and coins, which were all excluded from sight. They also tore in pieces my casket and **scattered** it among the rubbish. I thought no man regarded my sorrow or my anger. I became wholly discouraged and disheartened, and sat down and wept.”

Miller employs a variation of the word “scatter” seven times concerning the covering up of the foundational truths, before he sat down and wept. He is here representing the parallel between his history and the history of the one hundred and forty-four thousand. The Millerite history began prophetically with the conclusion of the seven times of Leviticus twenty-six which marked the “scattering” of the northern kingdom of Israel beginning in 723BC and concluding in 1798. At that point, (1798) John in Revelation five wept, for no man is found that is worthy to open the book that was sealed.

The opening of the book that was sealed with seven seals by the Lion of the tribe of Judah began in 1798, and also represented the increase of knowledge

referenced in Daniel twelve, that began when the book of Daniel was unsealed in 1798.

Miller's weeping represents a point in the future (1989) when the Lion of the tribe of Judah, identified as the dirt brush man in Miller's dream, would commence the work of removing the traditions and customs of Adventism that had been brought in since 1863. The Dirt Brush Man began His work at the time of the end in 1989 at the collapse of the Soviet Union (the king of the south) in fulfillment of Daniel 11:40.

Miller's weeping in 1989 at the time of the end parallels John's weeping in 1798 at the time of the end. The Dirt Brush Man's work parallels the work of removing the seven seals by the Lion of the tribe of Judah. Both these illustrations are represented by the increase of knowledge at the time of the end in Daniel 12.

The seven times which Miller expresses the word "scatter" does not represent time prophecy, for time is no longer after 1844, but represents a spiritual scattering that came upon Adventism as their wondering in the wilderness of Laodicea proceeded through their history. That history began with the rejection of the 2520 in 1863 and ended in 1989 at the time of the end; thus the 126 years represented by Miller's seven references to the scattering, also represents that 126 shekels in Belshazzar's handwriting on the wall equates to 2520 gerahs.

The spectators that accomplish the work of covering the foundational truths assembled by William Miller, represented as the jewels in the dream also tore in pieces the casket, thus marking the introduction of the modern Bible translations which undermine God's truth as set forth in the King James Bible.

"While I was thus weeping and mourning for my great loss and accountability, I remembered God, and earnestly prayed that He would send me help. Immediately the door opened, and a man entered the room, when the people all left it; and he, having a dirt brush in his hand, opened the windows, and began to brush the dirt and rubbish from the room.

"I cried to him to forbear, for there were some precious jewels scattered among the rubbish.

"He told me to 'fear not,' for he would 'take care of them.'"

It is Christ who is marked in the Scriptures as the One who expresses the words, "fear not." Christ is the Dirt Brush Man, the One who thoroughly puges His floor with His fan.

"Then, while he brushed the dirt and rubbish, false jewels and counterfeit coin, all rose and went out of the window like a cloud, and the wind carried them away. In the bustle I closed my eyes for a moment; when I opened them, the rubbish was all gone. The precious jewels, the diamonds, the gold and silver coins, lay scattered in profusion all over the room.

"He then placed on the table a casket, much larger and more beautiful than the former, and gathered up the jewels, the diamonds, the coins, by the handful, and cast them into the casket, till not one was left, although some of the diamonds were not bigger than the point of a pin.

The casket is much larger, for at the end of history it is not only the Bible, but also the *Spirit of Prophecy*. During the repetition of the Midnight Cry at the end of the world in the Latter Rain time period, Christ will pour out the Holy Spirit

which is represented as the wind. At Pentecost as well as during the Midnight Cry one of the works accomplished by the Holy Spirit when the wind begins to blow is that God opens to the minds of His followers the understanding of the Scriptures. This work of the Holy Spirit is the wind that blows the rubbish of Adventist traditions and customs out the window.

“He then called upon me to ‘come and see.’”

“Come and see” is the identical expression the Lion of the tribe of Judah employs when he calls for John to “come and see” what is found when he removes a seal from the book.

“I looked into the casket, but my eyes were dazzled with the sight. They shone with ten times their former glory.”

The truth of the third angel will swell into the loud cry and according to Sister White will be ten times more powerful than the Midnight Cry, and will also be based upon the foundational truths represented upon the 1843 pioneer chart which William Miller was used to recognize and proclaim.

“I thought they had been scoured in the sand by the feet of those wicked persons who had scattered and trod them in the dust. They were arranged in beautiful order in the casket, everyone in its place, without any visible pains of the man who cast them in. I shouted with very joy, and that shout awoke me.

At the repeat of the Midnight Cry all the virgins of Adventism will awake!

Comments by Jeff Pippenger